Can VAT Cuts Dampen the Effects of Food Price Inflation?

Youssef Benzarti UCSB & NBER Santiago Garriga CEFIP-UNLP Dario Tortarolo Nottingham & IFS

University of Michigan

February 6, 2023

VAT cuts have gained ground amidst rising inflation

- VAT has become a common policy tool used to affect the economy
- EU Parliament granted EU countries flexibility to change VAT rates (EU VAT Directive amended in April 2022)
- ► The IMF called for govts to avoid temporary VAT cuts on fuels, elect or food as an attempt to ↓ the impact of fast-rising inflation

VAT 'inflation' cuts are on the rise Many countries \downarrow VAT rates on a scale not seen before

E.g., for food:

- 1. Peru, Poland, Bulgaria, Lithuania, North Macedonia, Spain, Uruguay: 0% on basic food
- 2. Romania: considers cutting foodstuff VAT to 0%
- 3. Bosnia: 17% to 5% on foodstuff
- 4. Croatia: 13% to 5% on foodstuff
- 5. Latvia: 21% to 5% on foodstuff
- 6. Turkey: 8% to 1% on foodstuff
- 7. Greece: 24% to 13% on foodstuff
- 8. **Others:** Belgium, Italy, Germany, Ireland, Austria, Slovakia, Estonia

... and is even debated in the U.S.

States Turn to Tax Cuts as Inflation Stays Hot

Tax reductions and rebates that are being proposed to help people cope could have the unintended effect of pushing prices higher.





May 10, 2022

WASHINGTON — In Kansas, the Democratic governor has been pushing to slash the state's grocery sales tax. Last month, New Mexico lawmakers provided <u>\$1,000 tax rebates</u> to households hobbled by high gas prices. Legislatures in <u>Iowa, Indiana</u> and <u>Idaho</u> have all cut state income taxes this year. **Source: The New York Times**

\dots and is even debated in the U.S.



Governor Laura Kelly 🤣 @GovLauraKelly · Apr 29

Tonight's action was a win for every single Kansan -- we #AxedtheFoodTax. I'm ready to sign this bipartisan bill into law. We're going to save Kansans money and get them much-needed financial relief.



Govts often state specific goals when cutting VAT rates:
 (i) ↓ P and ↑ demand, (ii) ↑ cash flow/profits, (iii) ↑ wages

<u>EU Parliament</u>: "the deal struck by the Council (...) maintains the flexibility for Member States to lower VAT on essential products to benefit low-income households and, as such, tackle the regressiveness of the VAT system" Govts often state specific goals when cutting VAT rates: (i) ↓ P and ↑ demand, (ii) ↑ cash flow/profits, (iii) ↑ wages

<u>EU Parliament</u>: "the deal struck by the Council (...) maintains the flexibility for Member States to lower VAT on essential products to benefit low-income households and, as such, tackle the regressiveness of the VAT system"

Yet policymakers seem to ignore empirical tax incidence anomalies; and/or little is done to achieve the goals → Policy is expensive! Govts often state specific goals when cutting VAT rates: (i) ↓ P and ↑ demand, (ii) ↑ cash flow/profits, (iii) ↑ wages

<u>EU Parliament</u>: "the deal struck by the Council (...) maintains the flexibility for Member States to lower VAT on essential products to benefit low-income households and, as such, tackle the regressiveness of the VAT system"

Yet policymakers seem to ignore empirical tax incidence anomalies; and/or little is done to achieve the goals → Policy is expensive!

• Lack of (relevant) evidence \rightarrow inflation rare since late 1980's

We study whether temporarily reducing VAT rates can alleviate the effects of food price inflation on purchasing power

We study whether temporarily reducing VAT rates can alleviate the effects of food price inflation on purchasing power

 \Rightarrow **Setting**: a 4.5-month long VAT holiday on basic food + a variety of govt "mandates" in Argentine supermarkets

We study whether temporarily reducing VAT rates can alleviate the effects of food price inflation on purchasing power

 \Rightarrow **Setting**: a 4.5-month long VAT holiday on basic food + a variety of govt "mandates" in Argentine supermarkets

Govt was relatively successful at:

- Engineering instant price decreases in supermarkets using the VAT cut
- Mitigating the subsequent price increases using 'pass-through caps'

We study whether temporarily reducing VAT rates can alleviate the effects of food price inflation on purchasing power

 \Rightarrow **Setting**: a 4.5-month long VAT holiday on basic food + a variety of govt "mandates" in Argentine supermarkets

Govt was relatively successful at:

- Engineering instant price decreases in supermarkets using the VAT cut
- Mitigating the subsequent price increases using 'pass-through caps'

But it partially failed to reach the target population because:

- Low-income people tend to shop at small independent stores...
- where we find that the owners pocket most of the VAT cut

Contribution

1. VAT as a tool to affect economic variables:

★ Blundell (2009); Crossley et al (2009); Bachmann et al (2021); Slemrod (2011); Benzarti & Tazhitdinova (2011); Pomeranz (2015); Naritomi (2019); D'Acunto et al (2022)

 \rightarrow While VAT can be effective at lowering prices, the distributional effects can be unintended, in part because we don't yet fully understand tax incidence

Contribution

1. VAT as a tool to affect economic variables:

★ Blundell (2009); Crossley et al (2009); Bachmann et al (2021); Slemrod (2011); Benzarti & Tazhitdinova (2011); Pomeranz (2015); Naritomi (2019); D'Acunto et al (2022)

 \rightarrow While VAT can be effective at lowering prices, the distributional effects can be unintended, in part because we don't yet fully understand tax incidence

2. Economic incidence of consumption taxes and empirical anomalies:

★ Fullerton & Metcalf (2002); Benzarti et al (2020); Benzarti & Carloni (2019); Kosonen (2015); Kopczuk et al (2016); Benedek et al (2019); Carbonnier (2007); Fuest et al (2021); Buettner & Madzharova (2020); Harju et al (2018); Gaarder (2018); Bachas et al (2020); Genakos & Pagliero (2022)

 \rightarrow Govts can influence how much of a statutory tax change is passed on to consumers prices beyond relative magnitudes of S and D elasticities

 \rightarrow Pass-through can vary widely by type of supermarket consumers shop at

Outline

- 1. Setting: A temporary VAT cut on basic food
- 2. Scanner data & Empirical strategy (DiD)
- 3. Results
 - 3.1. Price responses pooling all stores
 - 3.2. Large vs small stores
 - 3.3. VAT increase with capped pass-through rates
 - 3.4. Quantity responses (inter-temporal substitution)
 - 3.5. (Unintended) distributional effects
- \star My research agenda

Timeline and Goal Enforcement



Timeline and Goal

Enforcement



• VAT cut: unanticipated, large, salient, and temporary

 \rightarrow Govt urged *full* pass-through to P (0.21/1.21=17.4%) [link]

Timeline and Goal

Enforcement



 VAT cut: unanticipated, large, salient, and temporary
 → Govt urged full pass-through to P

(0.21/1.21=17.4%) [link]

• VAT increase: back to 21%

 \rightarrow Govt imposed caps on how much P could increase (0%, 7%, or no cap)

Timeline and Goal

Enforcement



 VAT cut: unanticipated, large, salient, and temporary
 → Govt urged full pass-through to P

(0.21/1.21=17.4%) [link]

• VAT increase: back to 21%

 \rightarrow Govt imposed caps on how much P could increase (0%, 7%, or no cap)

• Price monitoring system:

 \rightarrow In chain supermarkets only! [link]

Barcode-level scanner data with P and Q

Treatment

Temporary 0% VAT

Categories

Cooking oils (sunflower, corn, mix) Rice Dried pasta Tea, Yerba Mate, and Mate Cocido Sugar Canned vegetables and beans Canned fruits Corn flour (*polenta*) Wheat flour Fluid milk (whole/skim) Yogurt (whole or skim) Eggs Bread Breadcrumbs and/or batter

Control

Standard 21% VAT

Categories

Other cooking oils (olive, soy, canola) Rice-based meals Breakfast cereal Coffee Salt Herbs, Spices, & Seasonings Dulce de leche (caramel) Jam and Jelly Other flours Crackers, Biscuits, Toasts, Puddings Chocolate Mayonnaise Vinegar Dried legumes and beans

Notes: Wheat flour and bread are taxed at the reduced rate of 10.5%. Source: Decree 567/2019 - Annex (IF-2019 - 73155740-APN-SCI#MPYT).

Data: Grocery Stores

1. Supermarket scanner data (Scentia)

- (1) Large chains (e.g., Walmart)
- (2) Small independent stores
 - Period: Jan'2018 Jun'2021 (182 weeks, 42 months)
 - Vars: barcode, description, price, quantity, total sales, 10 regions
 E.g., Twinings English Breakfast Tea 25 Bags

2. Panel of shoppers & Household Expenditure Survey

- To assess the distributional effects (8 income groups, monthly freq)
- 3. Price control data (2014-2020)
 - We built a database with all barcodes and regulated prices from 'Precios Cuidados' and 'Productos Esenciales'

Empirical strategy: Diff-in-Diffs

Run a dynamic DiD comparing T (0% VAT) and C (21% VAT):

$$Y_{it} = \alpha_i + \gamma_t + \sum_{t \neq 2019w32}^{2020w10} \beta_t D_{it} + \epsilon_{it}$$

- Y_{it}: PRICE (weighted average across stores) or QUANTITY (total sold)
- Y_{it*} = 100 (outcomes normalized to 100 for each barcode *i* on 2019w32)
- D_{it}: indicator for whether barcode i is treated in week t
- β_t : estimate the difference btw T and C relative to $t^* = 2019w32$
- We use a balanced panel of ≈5,000 barcodes
- S.E. clustered at the barcode and region level

The VAT abolishment was very salient

August 16, 2019 (1 day post announcement)



Tema del día e Nuevas medidas económica

Eliminan IVA en alimentos. congelan cuotas UVA y habría cambios de Gabinete

Deltator El diálogo y un atisbo de tregua ...



En busca de la mística perdida

Nuevo ataque del hacker que filtró datos de la Federal

Para Alberto F. el dólar a \$60 está bien v no hay razón para que aumente

Diosdado Cabello: "Que no vaya a creer que lo están eligiendo porque es él



Lavagna suspendió la campaña y pidió que lo imiter



Macri eliminó el IVA de 14 alimentos y congeló las cuotas de los créditos UVA

Economía. Alcanza a productos de la canasta básica, como leche, par, yerba, harina y arroz regirá hasta diciembre, igual que la suspensión del aurrento de los prestarsos hipotecarios

Value and a modules Langeapitemepender la composia

Presión militar china a Hong Kong



Dólar: cavó por primera

vez desde

las PASO

Filtraron archivos de la Federal sobre Chocobar



Devaluación. Cómo se protegen los clubes Elecutaron a en un búnker de drogas

...and so was the VAT increase with \neq caps

January 2, 2020 (2 days after VAT was reintroduced)



A partir de hoy, con la excepción de la leche

Aumentan hasta 10,5% los productos de la canasta básica por la vuelta del IVA

de 9% en aceiter y 10.5% en pan pillado. más Precios Caldados A4

Con mal clima y buen panorama la Costa arrancó sutemporada



Nisman: Alberto dice abora que no hay pruebas para afirmar que fue asesinado

El Personaja





de cada año nuevo



ASCOLIMPICO Teldo organizará los lacens

Rigen aumentos de entre 7 y 10,5% en la canasta básica v prometen más controles La Casa Rosada no prorrogó el IVA del O% y acordó morigerar el traslado a precios con

vales er an K.P.C. Laborhoffstella menta bistion, que verse la lei mine allevenimente mendres in de Mandorste de D

INFERNOEN AUSTRALIA

ELMINEO Pigne5

ajantes. Lorge de renationers que donne ros cast niere boss, el codiserto ren cast niere boss, el codiserto II prisernador bonaerenes And Excited, tendrá hor m

Cuatriciclos, con más restricciones



Alarma por Pirotecnia: por segundo año seguido, la escalada de baió el número de heridos en la ciudad tensión entre EE.UU. e Irán

The preserver, etc., etc. 5% allow debetedoperensione preserver and the preserver an

VELSEA Annon los catallos en CENTREMIN Pignal

> El vaivén con las naftas un símbolo del nuevo gobierno

Carlos Pased

Cambio de Fernández sobre el caso Nisman

documental grahade en 2007 dadó de un valcidio aser dijo-que no hay praebas de un asesicano

Soia: el 53% por hectárea quedaría nara el Estado

Ademaia

It was also highly publicized in stores (mandatory banners/tags)



Price responses pooling large and small stores

Price *levels* in Large + Small supermarkets



Substantial pass-through of the VAT cut to prices (\sim 60%)



Large vs small stores separately

Average pass-through of the VAT cut is 35% for indep stores and 85% for supermarket chains



Average pass-through of the VAT cut is 35% for indep stores and 85% for supermarket chains



Monitoring App/Platform (for large stores only!) •

A

Ξ

infobae

INFOBAE

Cuál será el efecto de la reducción del IVA en los alimentos básicos: habrá controles y sanciones del Gobierno

El director nacional de Defensa del Consumidor, Fernando Blanco Muiño, precisó qué tipo de herramientas se emplearán para que los precios no sigan en alza

16 de Agosto de 2019





Tamadelia set aunocado a vivense Lanzan un sistema para vigilar los precios de los supermercados

En Buenos Aires

Macri: el aumento a docentes no debe llegar al 30%

"El número no tiene que empezar con 3", le pidió a la gobernadora Vidal. Es por el impacto de esa negociación en las próximas paritarias con estables y privados. Pa

Deberán informar en tiempo real sus listas, empezando por los productos de la canasta básica. Y los consumidores podrán elegir a través de la Web donde comprar. El Gobierno, preocupado por la inflación, busca contrular los aumentos y el cumplimiento de los Precios Cuidados, es



Point estimates and pass-through rates

Table 3: Average price change between treated and untreated goods (monthly scanner data)

	Removal VAT	Re-introduction VAT
	(1)	(2)
(a) Large and small supermarkets (pool)		
Average price change (p.p.)	-10.5***	-0.9*
	(0.26)	(0.42)
Observations	661,264	661,264
Pass-through rate	60%	59%
(b) Large chains		
Average price change	-14.9***	-3.3***
	(0.40)	(0.55)
Observations	353.497	353,497
Pass-through rate	85%	81.7%
(c) Small stores		
Average price change	-6.2***	1.6***
	(0.32)	0.47)
Observations	307,767	307,767
Pass-through rate	36%	38%

Robustness and additional results

- Very similar results with official CPI data ••
- Pass-through of the Peso depreciation •
- Substitution across products in T and C •
- VAT changes + nominal price freezes •
- Overlap of barcodes across stores •
- Pass-through rates by region •
- Store-switching behavior •

Mitigating subsequent price increases using pass-through caps

A VAT increase with capped pass-through

- \bullet VAT rate \uparrow back to pre-holiday level of 21%
- But new govt limited the price increase with \neq caps
- *** No caps**: Prices could \uparrow up to 21%
- * Caps: Force incidence sharing
- We show that govts can successfully limit VAT pass-through

Treated: VAT back to 21%

Categories	$\Delta \mathbf{p}$ cap
Oil (sunflower & mix)	9%
Oil (corn)	No cap
Rice (regular: long grain white)	7%
Rice (other: basmati, brown, organic)	No cap
Dried pasta	7%
Tea, Yerba Mate, and Mate Cocido	7%
Sugar	7%
Canned vegetables and beans	7%
Canned fruits	No cap
Corn flour	7%
Wheat flour	7%
Fluid milk (whole/skim)	0%
Yogurt (regular)	7%
Yogurt (other: w/cereal, fruit chunks)	No cap
Eggs	7%
Sliced Bread (white)	7%
Sliced Bread (rest)	No cap
Breadcrumbs and/or batter	10.5%
Small stores (not subject to caps): No differential effects btw capped and uncapped goods



Large chains: Goods with flexible prices exhibit an increase \sim twice that of capped goods • Recall density



Large chains: Goods with flexible prices exhibit an increase \sim twice that of capped goods • Recall density



The gap is remarkably persistent (hysteresis)



Ultimately leading to a permanent price gap in necessities btw small and large supermarkets



Pass-through caps and online monitoring

- Small stores: FASA association not part of the agreement [link]
- Chain supermarkets: govt said they would track prices daily: [link]

"Supermarkets report their prices online to the Ministry of Commerce. The database is updated as soon as they upload the price lists, and we can see it. The sector already showed goodwill by working with us until December 31 and committed to absorb two-thirds of the impact. But obviously we'll be monitoring them." The government assures that it will control "online" that the new food price agreement is fulfilled



precios de los alimentos

Será a través de la Secretaría de Comercio, según confiaron a Clarín fuentes oficiales



El ministro de Producción, Matías Kulfas, estuvo a cargo del acuerdo por el IVA de los alimentos.







01/01/2020 13:36 / Clarincom Economia / Actualizado al 01/01/2020 16:06

Purchase responses

Quantity effects

Policy goal of the temporary VAT cut was to ensure that households would still be able to purchase necessities

- Income effect: increased purchasing power
- Intertemporal substitution effect: cheaper to consume today

An increase in units sold in supermarkets chains • covid-19



- The policy was successful at sustaining the demand for basic necessities
- But the govt may have overshot it, leading to some hoarding of commodities

Quantity effect is more muted in small stores • COVID-19



- The policy was successful at sustaining the demand for basic necessities
- Muted response in small stores where pass-through was limited

(Unintended) distributional consequences

Policy goal was to ensure that *low-income* households could still afford basic food in a context of inflation



Share of zero-rated goods in total food expenditure, by deciles (%)

- Targeted goods (T) more heavily consumed by the lowest deciles
- But average expenditure on T increases with income

Policy goal was to ensure that *low-income* households could still afford basic food in a context of inflation



- Targeted goods (T) more heavily consumed by the lowest deciles
- But average expenditure on T increases with income

But low-income people tend to shop at small supermarkets where price pass-through was limited (!)



Food expenditure in zero-rated products by type of store (%)

But low-income people tend to shop at small supermarkets where price pass-through was limited (!)



Food expenditure in zero-rated products by type of store (%)

- VAT cut likely benefited richer households more
- Important policy implication when designing VAT cuts

Concluding remarks

While VAT cuts and other govt 'mandates' can be effective tools to lower prices in grocery stores,

- 🖒 ensure continued access to basic food during high inflation,
- 🖒 mitigate subsequent price increases

They can lead to

- igsilon asymmetric responses across large and small supermarkets,
- hysteresis effects in the medium-run,
- unintended distributional/incidence effects

 \Rightarrow In all, the Arg experience helps us advance knowledge and sheds light on how tax incidence might operate in practice in grocery stores

THANK YOU :)

Research Agenda

- 1. Price/quantity/distributional effects of \neq policies in grocery stores
 - Today's paper
 - Price controls in supermarkets
 - The detaxation of women's period products ('tampon tax')
- 2. Offshore tax evasion and domestic property tax compliance
 - ► Tax amnesty paper (revealing 21% of GDP in hidden assets)
 - RCT 1 to measure spillover effects in property tax compliance
 - RCT 2 to analyze taxpayers responses to progressive tax reforms
- 3. Effect of transfer and tax collection systems
 - Firms as tax collectors (withholding systems)
 - Wage effects of means-tested transfers (e.g., EITC)
- 4. Labor supply and demand responses to income taxation
 - Real LS responses to an income tax holiday
 - Supply/demand effects of taxing/de-taxing overtime work in France

Additional results

Elections, currency devaluation, and VAT cut/hike • Back



Context: high inflation (\sim 55%), elections, peso devaluation

- 1) President Macri defeated in primary presidential elections by a 15.5 p.p. margin—much wider than expected
- 2) Day after: Argentina's currency collapsed (45 \rightarrow 62 pesos-dollar)
- 3) Govt implements a temporary VAT holiday on basic food set to expire on Dec 31, 2019 [Goal: to contain the impact of devaluation on prices]
- New president Fernandez didn't extend the VAT holiday Regulated repeal: limit price increase to 7% (0% for milk, no cap for some)

At the core of the debate... • Back



Alberto Fernández 🗇 @alferdez IN Representante gubernamental de Argentina

No parece razonable reducir el IVA indiscriminadamente como se ha hecho. Ello no redundará en una merma de los precios. Seguramente se convertirá en una ganancia adicional para las empresas. Hubiera sido mejor devolver el IVA a los sectores más postergados.

Translate Tweet

9:02 PM · Aug 16, 2019

7,051 Retweets 943 Quote Tweets 23.4K Likes

"It's unreasonable to reduce the VAT indiscriminately as has been done. This will not result in a decrease in prices. It will surely be pocketed by companies. It would have been better to rebate the VAT to the most neglected sectors."

Normative debate: VAT cuts or targeted tax rebates



- Commonly argued that policy should target the most needy
- \star E.g., VAT rebates through debit cards

• Tarjeta Alimentar

- \star Debit card to purchase basic food
- * For AUH recipients with children up to 14yo
 * 2.5m cardholders (95% are women) covering about 4m children
- A tool with potential for targeted VAT rebates [Press]
- * But subject to pitfalls when poorly designed (e.g., see Cruces et al, 2020)

Enforcement tools at hand •Back

Ξ

infobae

Θ

INFOBAE

Cuál será el efecto de la reducción del IVA en los alimentos básicos: habrá controles y sanciones del Gobierno

El director nacional de Defensa del Consumidor, Fernando Blanco Muiño, precisó qué tipo de herramientas se emplearán para que los precios no sigan en alza

16 de Agosto de 2019



Enforced by the Consumer Protection Agency:

- <u>*Precios Claros*</u>: Online price monitoring system since Feb'16
- *Ley de Lealtad Comercial*: Fair Retail Trade Law passed in Apr'19

Enforcement tools at hand

The Head of the Consumer Protection Agency stated: [link]

- "Daily, between 6 and 8am, all supermarket chains in the country submit their prices through the <u>App</u> 'Precios Claros'. This provides us with updated info that can be compared with historical data."
- "We will control stores to ensure that the tax cut is passed on to lower prices and not higher profits."
- "The Consumer Protection Agency will act through the regime of <u>fines</u> supported by the <u>Fair Retail Trade Law</u>."

Collusion? Unlikely Back

				X	Contractor				
ambiar ubicación	76130	Tafe Gold Blend 100 Gr 81154111	<		Cambiar ubicación	Partie	Mate Cocido en Playadito 50 U 7793704000768	n Saquitos In	<
and by one, carried, rioring	Comercio	Oistancia	* Precio de lista	© Promo A © Promo B ©	Calle 24 618, La Plata, Provinc	Comercia		Distancia	
 productos de Alimentos congelados Almacén 	Calle 30 Y Calle LA PLATA	637777 0.36 idometros	\$1 909,00		Ver productos de Alimentos congelados	Dio (2) Supe Calle Di C	meetades DA 48 N944 None 425 ARES	LOI kildmetros	
Bebidas con alcohol Bebidas sin alcohol	Dio (2) Supermercados Calle 48 NMA BUENOS ARES	DIA None sätikömetros	\$1744,00		Bebidas con alcohol Bebidas sin alcohol	Concerned Conte	10(5A 43.712 12	135 kilómetros	
Bebés Electrodomésticos y equipamiento para el	COTO OCSA Calle 43 782 La Plata	186 kilimatos	\$1964,90	\$1 670,0	Bebés Electrodomésticos y equipamiento para el	Dro (8) Supo Ar 4 SUE	meetadas DA 4 2099 105 AIRES	150 kilómetras	
Frescos Limpleza	Dia (2) Supermercados Av 44 2099 BUENOS ARRES	DIA 130 Milmetros	\$174,00		hogar Frescos Limpieza	Dia 20 Sept	mercades DA 12 H3H 405 AIRES	201 klómetros	
Mascotas Materiales para la construcción	Dio (2) September Av S32 181 BLENOS ARES	ba 2.01 kildmetrus	\$1714,00		Mascotas Materiales para la construcción	Deo (2) Supe Asi 7 Succ	meetades DA 423 None CS ARES	2.21 kilometrus	
Perfumería y cuidado personal	Market Calle 12 (200 La Plata	2.07 köömetros	\$1 650,00		Perfumería y cuidado personal	Caller Caller	PMERCADOS EL 59 2006 .413	2.37 kilómetras	
Tipos de comencia (7) Todos ~	Dio (2) Supermercados An. 7 423 Noree BLENOS ARES	DIA 2.31 kilómetros	\$174,00		Refinar por Tipos de comercio (7) Todos	Dio 8 Sape	mercades DA 4 581 ICS ARES	2.45 kiómetros	
Comercios (46) Todos	-D Calle 7 767 Knowlet La Plata	3.37 kildmetrus	\$1 650.00		Correctos (46)	Dira (2) Sapa Calle BUE	mercades DAA 12 1514 105 AIRES	2.63 klómetros	
Puntos de venta (30)	Calle 59 2036	05 EL 2.39 iolimatros	\$1 599,00		Pontas de venta (38)	Composition Control Vision Aver	erativa Obresa Li- la de Consumo y eda 10 7 1224	2.69 kilómetrus	

* Promo A * Promo 8 * * Precio de lista

Collusion? Unlikely • Back

© Cambiar ubirarión	Î	Coca Cola sin 7790895067556	Azucar 1.5 Lt 🤇	(
Calle 24 618, La Plata, Provinc					
Ver productos de Alimentos congelados	Comercia Diro 🛞	Supermercades DIA Calle 48 NIN44 None DUENCS ARES	Distancia LOI kilómetros	* Precio de lista \$225.50	Promo A Promo B
Almacén					
Bebidas con alcohol		Sepermentades DIA			
Bebidas sin alcohol	Dio 🙁	BUENOS AIRES	130 kilometros	\$225,50	
Bebés		Transmission PEA			
Electrodomésticos y equipamiento para el bogar	Dia 🗵	Ar 532 1131 BUENOS ARES	2.01 killinetos	\$25.50	
Frescos	martin	Market Calle 12 1200 La Plata	2.07 kilómetros	\$297,50	
Limpieza					
Mascotas	Dec (7)	Sepermentados DAA Au: 7 423 None		6770.00	
Materiales para la construcción	Did 20	BUENOS ARES		0410,00	
Perfumeria y cuidado personal		Market Calle 7.757 La Plata	2.57 którestros	\$297,50	
Refinar por					
Tipos de comencia (7) Todos	0 aa	SLIPERMERCADOS EL NEME Caño 59 2006 LA PLATA	2.39 Monetos	\$322,50	
Cornercios (46)		Septemercades DA Av 44 561 BUENOS AIRES	2.46 kilimatos	\$225.50	
Todos v	_				
Pantos de venta (30)	Dio 🕅	Sepermercades DA Calle 12 1514 BUENOS ARES	2.63 iolómetros	\$225.50	
Todos v		Committee Plance LL			
		nittida de Consumo y Vivienda Avenida 7 1224	2.69 kilómetros	\$362,00	

Cambiar ubicación		Fideos Tallarines Matarazzo 500 Cr Cr 77500703188657			
Calle 24 618, La Plata, Provinc	Connector		A Distance	A Decide de Dete	
Ver productos de Alimentos congelados	Disco	Disca Galle 30 Y Galle 47 777 LA PLATA	COG kilometras	\$2100	
Almacén					
Bebidas con alcohol	Dec . 10	Supermentados DIA Calle 48 N944 None			
Bebidas sin alcohol	Dig 🛛	BUENOS AIRES	LUI MILLIOUS	2014/00	
Bebés		(1770) (1774)			
Electrodomésticos y equipamiento para el hogar	2000	Calle 43 782 La Plata	tas kióretros	92.9	\$180,64
Frescos	Dio 🛛	Supermented to DIA Avi 44 2029 BUENOS AIRES	1.90 kilómetras	\$204,35	
Limpieza	_				
Mascotas	Dec 22	Supermentados DIA Av 532 1131	3.01 killionatore	5304.35	
Materiales para la construcción	ono go	BUENDS AIRES			
Perfumeria y cuidado personal	market	Market Calle 12 1200 La Plata	2.07 kilómetros	\$203,00	
Refinar por					
Tipos de correctio (7) Todos v	Dio 🖾	Supermencados DIA Au. 7 423 None BUENOS AIRES	2.31 kilómetros	\$204,35	
Converties (46)	minut	Mariaet Galle 7.767 La Plata	2.37 kildmettos	5203,00	
Todos					
Pantos de venta (30)	0	SUPERMERCADOS EL NENE Calle S9 2086 LA PLATA	2.39 klómetrus	\$195,00	
Todos v					
	Dio 🛛	Supermercados DIA Av A4 501 BUENOS AIRES	2.46 kilometros	\$204,35	
	Dio 😒	Supermentados DIA Calle 12 1514 DUENES AIRES	2.68 islametos	\$204.35	

Price levels in small independent stores • Back



Price levels in supermarket chains (prices are monitored) • Back



Control goods: Large chains vs Small stores Back



Treated goods: Large chains vs Small stores • Back



Price levels in supermarket chains (weekly data) • Back



Note: *Obs*=2,541,535 (4645 EANs: 2,032 treated + 2,613 control)

Average price pass-through of \sim 85% in large chains \bullet Buck



Note: *Obs*=2,541,535 (4645 EANs: 2,032 treated + 2,613 control)

Small stores cheaper (pre-reform) than chain supermarkets



Small stores cheaper (pre-reform) than chain supermarkets



Small stores cheaper (pre-reform) than chain supermarkets












Price density for overlapped and non-overlapped barcodes • Back



Price density for overlapped barcodes • Back Var: $P_{ir,t0}^{\text{Small}}/P_{ir,t0}^{\text{Large}} * 100$



Distrib of *price changes* two weeks **before** VAT removal Large chains (prices are monitored) • Back





Distrib of price changes right after VAT reinstated

Large chains (prices are monitored)

Com in

Cap section

Back



Distrib of price changes right after VAT removal • Back Large chains (treated goods)



Distrib of price changes: VAT reinstated • Back Large chains



Distrib of price changes after VAT removal

Small stores vs Large chains
• Overlap T & C
• Back



Distrib of price changes: VAT removal Back

Small stores vs Large chains



Distrib of price changes: VAT removal Back

Small stores vs Large chains



Pass-through of the 2018 peso depreciation • Back

Exchange Rate (pesos per dollar)



Are goods in **T** and **C** similarly affected by the 2018 peso depreciation? • Back



Do **large** and **small** stores respond *differently* to a large economic shock with no govt mandate? •Back



Pass-through of a 24% currency devaluation (no mandate) is similar in small and large supermarkets



Pass-through of a 24% currency devaluation (no mandate) is similar in small and large supermarkets



Pass-through of currency devaluation: short run (Large chains)



Small stores vs Large chains • Overlap T & C Back Small stores Density Density 0.15 0.20 Treated Treated Small stores Control Control (placebo) 0.15 0.10 0.10 0.05 0.05 0.00 0.00 -15 -10 10 20 25 -20 -15 -10 10 20 25 30 30 35 APrice (p.p.): Jan'20 vs Dec'19 ΔPrice (p.p.): Feb'20 vs Jan'20 Large chains Density Density 0.15-0.20-Treated Treated Large chains Control Control (placebo) 0.15 0 10 -0.10 0.05 0.05 0.00 -0.00 -15 -10 10 25 30 35 -20 -15 -10 20 25 30 APrice (p.p.): Jan'20 vs Dec'19 ΔPrice (p.p.): Feb'20 vs Jan'20

Distrib of price changes after VAT re-introduction

Distrib of price changes after VAT re-intro • Back Small stores vs Large chains



Distrib of price changes after VAT re-intro • Back

Small stores vs Large chains



Close substitutes in C (e.g., coffee) do not seem to adjust prices after the VAT cut • Back Density Control: close substitutes 0.20 Control: rest 0.15 0.10 0.05 Allia densially 0.00 25 -5 -20-15 -10 5 10 20 -25 15 0 △Price (p.p.): Week 1 vs Week -1

Does substitution across T and C bias our price effects? The results barely change when: • Back

- Including and excluding close substitutes in the control group
- Using food and non-food products in the control group



Does substitution across T and C bias our price effects? The results barely change when: • Back

- Including and excluding close substitutes in the control group
- Using food and non-food products in the control group



DiD of close substitutes in C vs rest of C • Back











Barcodes sold in both small & large stores (overlap) vs sold in either small or large stores (no overlap) • Back



Capped VAT increase: Rice • Back

Regular Rice (7% cap) vs Other Rice (no cap)



Capped VAT increase: Rice • Back

Regular Rice (7% cap) vs Other Rice (no cap)



Capped VAT increase: Canned food • Back

Canned vegetables (7% cap) vs Canned fruit (no cap)


Capped VAT increase: Canned food • Back

Canned vegetables (7% cap) vs Canned fruit (no cap)



Capped VAT increase: Sliced bread • Back Slide bread (white) (7% cap) vs Sliced bread (rest) (no cap)



Capped VAT increase: Sliced bread • Back Slide bread (white) (7% cap) vs Sliced bread (rest) (no cap)



Capped VAT increase: Milk • Back

Milk (0% cap): Full incidence on the supply



Capped VAT increase: Milk • Back

Milk (0% cap): Full incidence on the supply



Regular Yogurt (7% cap) vs **Other Yogurt** (no cap)







Sunflower Oil (9% cap) vs Corn Oil (no cap)



Sunflower Oil (9% cap) vs Corn Oil (no cap)



Pass-through under nominal price controls

VAT changes + price controls • Back

We show that price freezes are more effective at keeping controlling prices than capping the percent increase in prices

Productos Esenciales: 64 barcodes of the Basic Food Basket with price frozen for 6 months (Apr 29–Oct 31, 2019) • Tag • More

► Logic: Price caps limit the incidence of VAT cuts: Stores keep regulated price ⇒ pocket entire VAT reduction

We flag these 64 barcodes in our data and run the DiD

- Treated: 38 EANs (N=34,795)
- Control: 10 EANs (N=11,863); 16 missing (no data)
- (1) Compare Essential barcodes in T vs Rest of goods in T and C
- (2) Compare Essential barcodes in T vs C

Price Controls: mandatory tags, banners, and App



[1] Productos Esenciales (in T) vs Rest (T and C)



[1] Productos Esenciales (in T) vs Rest (T and C)



[2] Productos Esenciales: in T and C • DD



Two complementary policy tools • Back

Monitoring App:

- - Large grocery stores must report daily price data (Art 4: except SMEs)
 - Consumers can search prices/location from web-page or app
 - Administered/enforced by the Consumer Protection Office

Price Controls:

- Precios Cuidados: A list of mass consumption goods with controlled prices (≈500 barcodes, e.g., Coke 1.5L). Since 2014
 - Updated every 4 months; Mandatory tags; Audits; High penalties
- Productos Esenciales: Govt froze the price of 64 barcodes in the Basic Food Basket for 6 months (Apr 29–Oct 31, 2019)
 - High compliance: Daily audits in 2,500 points of sale in the country to detect non-compliance and missing products

[2] Productos Esenciales: Dynamic DiD • Back



[1] Productos Esenciales (in T) vs Rest (T and C)



[1] Productos Esenciales (in T) vs Rest (T and C) • Back



[2] Productos Esenciales: in T and C



[2] Productos Esenciales: Dynamic DiD • Back



Quantity effects in the longer run •Back



Quantity effects in the longer run • Back



Quantity effect (Dynamic DiD): Large chains • Back



Quantity effect (Dynamic DiD): Large chains • Back





Quantity effect (Dynamic DiD): Large chains • Back

Cooking oil vs Control






















Low-income people do not seem to switch to chain supermarkets • Back



% of 0-rated goods consumed by each income group

Low-income people do not seem to switch to chain supermarkets • Back



% of untreated goods consumed by each income group

Heterogeneities by products



Robustness (aggregate price data)

- Result is also present in aggregate price data!
- National Institute of Statistics (INDEC) publishes average monthly prices of some products (link) used in the CPI index (59 products in GBA; 14 products across 6 regions)
- ▶ We break the list into T (0% VAT) and C (21% VAT) and run:

$$\log P_{it} = \alpha_i + \gamma_t + \sum_{t \neq 2019m7}^{2020m5} \beta_t D_{it} + \epsilon_{it}$$

 D_{it} is an indicator that denotes whether product i is treated in month tCoefficients β_t test the effect relative to 2019m7

Pass-through to consumer prices [levels]



Partial pass-through [DiD] • Back • Robustness

